

Elkhart Historic & Cultural Preservation Commission

Regular Meeting Thursday, March 17, 2022

Call to Order:

Ann Linley called to order the Elkhart Historic & Cultural Preservation Commission Regular Meeting for Thursday, March 17, 2022 at 7:15 pm.

Roll Call:

Present: Bobby Glassburn (remotely), JA Whitmer, Bill Zimmerman and Ann Linley; also Nathan Hooley with the City of Elkhart and Deb Parcell with Indiana Landmarks.

Absent: Aaron Mishler and Raymond Enfield.

Approval of Agenda:

Ann Linley asked for a motion to approve the agenda as presented. Motion made by JA Whitmer, seconded by Bill Zimmerman; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

Approval of Minutes:

Ann Linley gave everyone a minute to look over the minutes from the January 20, 2022 meeting. Ms. Linley said she would accept a motion to approve the January 20, 2022 minutes. Motion made by JA Whitmer, seconded by Bill Zimmerman; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

Financial Report:

None

Hearing of Visitors:

There was one visitor who was only observing.

Old Business:

A: Neighborhood Update/Progress Review/Nominations

Nathan Hooley advised that there is going to be a new park on Division Street. Ann Linley said she believed the Commission would receive an invite to the planning meeting for said park. Also the staff

is working with Carrie Brunson, from the Health Department, to obtain a lead grant so she can do classes.

Deb Parcell stated that 519 W. Franklin Street was sold in February to a couple from Chicago that have a lot of good plans for the property. Ms. Parcell said they are probably interested in a local designation.

New Business:

A: 22-COA-01, 132 STATE STREET, WINDOW REPLACEMENT

Since applicant was not present, Ann Linley said she would accept a motion to deny 22-COA-01. Motion made by Bill Zimmerman, seconded by JA Whitmer; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

B: 22-COA-02, 231 DIVISION STREET, WINDOW REPLACEMENT

Applicant's name: Katiria Cruz/Juan

Project property address: 231 Division Street

Local landmark or District: State and Division Local and National Register Historic District

Rating: Contributing

Architectural style: Free Classic

Architect/Builder: Unknown

Date Constructed: Circa 1899

Description of structure: The subject property is a two-story, wood frame, house set upon a stone foundation with an asphalt shingle gabled roof. A porch spans the front facade. The house was originally clad with wood clapboard siding; gable ends contain decorative fish scale siding; slightly flared roofline on gable ends. Windows are primarily one/one wood double hung; several fixed windows, including one in the front attic gable, feature a diamond grid pattern. A hooded box bay window with decorative brackets below is located on the east side. The 1910 Sanborn map shows a 1-story porch at the rear of the house and 2-car hip roof garage at the rear of the property.

Alterations: Asphalt shingle siding has been installed over wood clapboards. Aluminum storms or plexiglass cover all wood windows. A full-lite storm door has been installed over the front door. The rear of the house has been covered with T1-11. The original garage disappeared by 1927. Sometime after 1952, the rear porch was removed and a gable roof garage closer to the house was added.

Description of proposed project: Change windows or replace windows.

Application Ordinance Authority: Section 12.6 of Ordinance 4041 of the City of Elkhart requires a Certificate of Appropriateness to be issued for a conspicuous change in the exterior appearance of the existing building by demolitions, moving, additions, new construction, alteration, color change or maintenance of existing buildings, including windows, doors and all exterior features, walls or fences. As such, a Certificate of Appropriateness must be issued for the work proposed at the 231 Division Street.

Applicable Guidelines and Section: Windows and Doors: Retain original windows and doors, including sash, lintels, sills, shutters, decorative glass, pediments, hoods and hardware. Most wood windows can be repaired at a lesser cost than removing existing windows and buying and installing properly sized replacement windows. If deteriorated beyond repair, do not replace with new materials such as aluminum or vinyl.

Staff recommendation: While it can be assumed that lead paint exists in a house of this age, it cannot be assumed that the windows are causing a health risk and must be removed. A lead-based risk assessment should be done before a determination can be made. Vinyl windows are not approved for the historic district. Staff recommends denial for lack of complete information.

Deb Parcell further noted that last year there was a COA, for the same property and the same project, that was denied due to lack of representation; but at that time, she made a site visit. Ms. Parcell and the property owner talked about the windows, she took pictures and assessed the condition of the windows. Ms. Parcell said the windows do not warrant replacement, they are in very good condition but the concern now is about lead. She says the source of the lead problem is not known due to the lack of a risk assessment. To her knowledge, no risk assessment has been done and it is hard to make a determination without one.

Ann Linley asked the applicant how are they aware of the lead problem since there has been no lead assessment.

All comments made by the petitioner, unfortunately, were in audible.

Ann Linley advised the petitioner they would need to have the Health Department do lead testing, before the Commission could approve anything. Ms. Linley further advised that getting rid of lead is not a project the homeowner would want to undertake because they could make the problem worse. She further advised that the Health Department would provide funding and experts to properly remove the lead.

All comments made by the petitioner, unfortunately, were in audible.

Ann Linley said the Commission would like Deb Parcell and the Health Department to go out and make an assessment before the homeowners would do anything.

All comments made by the petitioner, unfortunately, were in audible.

JA Whitmer pointed out that the project is to remove the windows, but it may be possible to remove the lead paint and retain the windows if they are in sufficiently good condition. Ms. Whitmer said the Commission encourages preservation and pointed out the wood in the windows now is better than the wood today. Ms. Whitmer said that Deb Parcell and the Health Department working together would be able to help the petitioner with the expert help that is needed.

Bill Zimmerman asked if the Health Department had determined that the problem is just the windows and that there is no other lead based paint in the house.

The petitioner said it is just the windows.

Ann Linley asked for a motion to table 22-COA-02 until the April meeting. Motion made by Bill Zimmerman, seconded by JA Whitmer; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

C: INDIANA LANDMARKS PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT- 2022

JA Whitmer asked if there was anything different from last year. Ann Linley said there would be an increase for next year.

Ann Linley said she would accept a motion to approve the Indiana Landmarks Professional Services Agreement for 2022. Motion made by JA Whitmer and Seconded by Bobby Glassburn; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

D: WINDOWS WORKSHOP GRANT- INDIANA LANDMARKS

Deb Parcell would like to select a house within the District and using a trained window professional, use it to talk about the window replacement process, demonstrate the process, with people getting some hands-on experience. It would be free, educational, and provide some out reach.

Ann Linley pointed out that the Commission had done window workshops before.

Deb Parcell, in discussions with Eric Trotter, talked about incorporating the Health Department for lead education, including other construction professionals and reaching out to especially the Spanish speaking community.

Deb Parcell said Indiana Landmarks and Indiana Humanities have Historic Preservation Education Grants to benefit communities. Ms. Parcell discussed the "Big Picture" idea with the person that oversees the grant for Indiana Landmarks, Susan Stannis and she said this is the type of project they are looking for. The grant is for up to \$2500 and it has to be a match with either in-kind donations or dollars. We are, unfortunately past the first round, the second round deadline is September 30, 2022 and projects could begin November 15, 2022 or after.

Ann Linley asked what was needed of the Commission. Deb Parcell said she needed someone to apply for the grant, she would help with getting it completed and she would send it to Suzanne for review and feedback. Ms. Linley said there was monies available in the Commission donation account, approximately \$5,000.

Bobby Glassburn spoke in favor of the project. He said getting contractors that are qualified is paramount and would like to take that further in developing a resource list for others who would possibly need the same help.

JA Whitmer and Bill Zimmerman also spoke in favor of the project.

Ann Linley said she would accept a motion to proceed with the exploration of the Grant Workshop. Motion made by Bill Zimmerman and Seconded by JA Whitmer; motion carried with the following roll-call vote:

Bobby Glassburn- Yes

JA Whitmer- Yes

Bill Zimmerman- Yes

Ann Linley- Yes

Announcements:

Deb Parcell said that it was pointed out that the Commission may want to consider Preservation Awards. Ms. Parcell mentioned the wonderful job, by Lacasa on the 146 State Street project, is due in large part to their two very skilled carpenters and it would be great if these two men could be honored by the Commission. Eric Trotter would check for the vendors previously used and the appropriate wording. Bobby Glassburn had information on the vendor: Smith's 18th Street Picture Framing. Ann Linley said there would be an organizational award for Lacasa and two individual awards for the carpenters.

Adjournment:

Ann Linley said she would except a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:56 pm. Motion made by JA Whitmer, seconded by Bill Zimmerman; motion carried.



Ann Linley, Chair